

RESOLUTION NO. _____

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE ADMINISTRATOR FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS TO AWARD CONTRACT NO. E-10-012-201, 21ST CENTURY WATERFRONT ROSS'S LANDING RIVERFRONT PARK IMPROVEMENTS TO SMITH CONTRACTORS, INC. IN THE AMOUNT OF FIVE MILLION SEVEN HUNDRED TWO THOUSAND TWO HUNDRED FIFTY DOLLARS (\$5,702,250.00), WITH A CONTINGENCY AMOUNT OF FIVE HUNDRED THOUSAND DOLLARS (\$500,000.00), FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED SIX MILLION TWO HUNDRED TWO THOUSAND TWO HUNDRED FIFTY DOLLARS (\$6,202,250.00).

BE IT RESOLVED BY THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CHATTANOOGA, TENNESSEE, that the Administrator for the Department of Public Works to award Contract No. E-10-012-201, 21st Century Waterfront Ross's Landing Riverfront Park Improvements to Smith Contractors, Inc. in the amount of \$5,702,250.00, with a contingency amount of \$500,000.00, for an amount not to exceed \$6,202,250.00.

ADOPTED: _____, 2014

/mem

City of Chattanooga



Resolution/Ordinance Request Form

Date Prepared: June 16, 2014

Preparer: Dennis Malone

Department: Public Works

Brief Description of Purpose for Resolution/Ordinance:

Res./Ord. # _____

Council District # _____

7

A City Council resolution is requested to award Contract No. E-10-012-201, 21st Century Waterfront Ross's Landing Riverfront Park Improvements, to Smith Contractors, Inc., in the amount \$5,702,250.00 with a contingency amount of \$500,000.00 for a not-to-exceed amount of \$6,202,250.00.

Name of Vendor/Contractor/Grant, etc.	Smith Contractors, Inc.	New Contract/Project? (Yes or No)	Yes
Total project cost \$	<u>6,202,250.00</u>	Funds Budgeted? (YES or NO)	Yes
Total City of Chattanooga Portion \$	<u>6,202,250.00</u>	Provide Fund	4021
City Amount Funded \$	<u>6,202,250.00</u>	Provide Cost Center	A60416
New City Funding Required \$	_____	Proposed Funding Source if not budgeted	_____
City's Match Percentage %	_____	Grant Period (if applicable)	_____

List all other funding sources and amount for each contributor.

Amount(s)	Grantor(s)
_____	_____
_____	_____
_____	_____
_____	_____

Agency Grant Number _____

CFDA Number if known _____

Other comments: (Include contingency amount, contractor, and other information useful in preparing resolution)

FUNDED IN FY14

Approved by: _____

Reviewed by: FINANCE OFFICE

DESIGNATED OFFICIAL/ADMINISTRATOR

Please submit completed form to @budget, City Attorney and City Finance Officer

Revised: 1/26/09



J232253

June 16, 2014

Mr. Dennis Malone, PE
Assistant City Engineer
City of Chattanooga
Development Resource Center
1250 Market Street, Suite 2100
Chattanooga, TN 37402

**RE: CITY OF CHATTANOOGA – ROSS'S LANDING RIVERFRONT PARK IMPROVEMENTS
(#E-10-012-201) BID EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF AWARD**

Dear Mr. Malone:

We have reviewed the tabulated bids received for the base bid, reviewed bids in detail, and reviewed the supplemental information provided by the low bidder Smith Contractors, Inc. (SCI).

A recap of the bids from the two bidders is as follows:

BASIS OF AWARD	BIDDER		ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE
	Smith Contractors	Wright Brothers Construction	
BASE BID	\$5,702,250	\$6,358,255	\$7,204,000

As shown above, Smith Contractors provided the lowest bid for the Base Bid. The bid included all the required documents.

After review of the information provided in the bid packages, we met with SCIs by video conference on June 12th to discuss their approach to the project and answer specific questions and concerns that we had. The one-hour and fifteen-minute meeting was attended by HDR representatives (Dan Garza, P.E. and Navin Galani, P.E.) and SCI representatives (Kerry Smith, Owner and Joe Smith, Project Manager).

Supplemental information was provided during the week of June 9 through June 13 us addressing some of our questions. The supplemental information included a preliminary project schedule and key project staff resumes.

We conducted an evaluation to address the fitness and ability of the company to satisfactorily perform and complete the work required for the Base Bid. We reviewed the materials provided by SCI. We

hdrinc.com

555 N. Carancahua, Suite 1600, Corpus Christi, TX 78401
T 361.696.3300 F 361.696.3385
Texas Registered Engineering Firm F-754

also made inquiries to engineering firms associated with current SCI projects. Attached is a summary table of our inquiries and reviews.

We offer our opinions and observations as follows, with some of our reservations noted:

1. **Project Experience**

HDR evaluated the type of work similarities of the company's project experience with the base bid. The majority of the current projects for SCI involve work at waste water treatment plants and water treatment plants. The sole project with similarities to the Ross's Landing Project on their current projects list is a Cargo Dock under construction for the Owensboro Riverport Authority in Owensboro, KY. Confirmations were made with the Owner's representative that the information contained provided by SCI was accurate. Confirmations were also made with current project engineering consultant on that project.

HDR has reservations concerning the majority of SCI's prior projects not being similar in scope to the Ross's Landing Park Improvements Project. However, the work at the Owensboro Cargo Dock had similar components (steel sheet piling driving) and the client stated their satisfaction with the quality of SCI's work.

2. **References**

We have checked references for SCI, which include GRW Engineers (TN), J.C. Hailey Engineers (TN), Bell Engineers (KY), and Owensboro Riverport Authority, KY (Owner). The references generally spoke very highly of SCI with the added information as follows:

- Not 'change-order' minded
- Pleased with the work effort
- No contractor claims were filed
- Construction completed on schedule or early
- Team players
- Deliberate in their work; planned the work
- Completed project representatives were extremely satisfied with the way SCI performed and with the final product.

3. **Personnel and Suppliers**

The key personnel and suppliers are as follows:

Dennis Muse – Project Superintendent and QC Manager

Joe Smith – Project Manager

Sheet Pile, H-Pile, and Pipe Pile Supplier – Skyline Steel

Rock and Soil Anchor Installer – Rembco Geotechnical Contractor

HDR has reservations concerning the lack of a QC Manager, outside of the dual effort of the Project Superintendent. However, the references we spoke with indicated they were satisfied with the quality of the work product and their ability to produce timely and sufficient submittals, while minimizing resubmittals.

4. Bid Price

The bid price between the lowest and second bidders was 10.3% (\$656,005), with the majority of the bid in the mobilization/demobilization line item (\$150,000 vs. \$730,600). We believe the bid indicates SCI's ability to perform the work without cutting corners and giving the project the necessary attention and staffing. Refer to Attachment A for the Bid Tabulation.

5. Financial Fitness

We obtained a copy of the Dunn & Bradstreet report (refer to Attachment B) addressing financial aspects of SCI. No "red flags" were noted.

Summary

Although given the reservations that SCI has not completed a project of the type of Ross's Landing, they have performed all of the different work components. They have committed to using highly experience staff in key roles. Although given the reservations concerning their quality control, their prior clients have a high degree of satisfaction in the work product. They appear to have met the minimum specifications set forth in the bid documents, and have the ability and willingness to perform as a sufficiently responsible contractor to complete the project according to the specifications.

Recommendation

HDR recommends that the City of Chattanooga award the project to the lowest responsible bidder, Smith Contractors, Inc.

Thanks again for letting us help in this project. If you have any questions, please feel free to give me a call.

Sincerely,


Daniel E. Garza, P.E.
Project Manager

Enclosures:

Attachment A – Bid Tabulation
Attachment B – Dunn & Bradstreet Report

BID BREAKDOWN - BASE BID																	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	HDR				Smith Contractors, Inc				Wright Brothers Construction Company, Inc.							
		QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL EXTENDED PRICE	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL EXTENDED PRICE	QUANTITY	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL EXTENDED PRICE				
1	Mobilization and Demobilization	1	LS	\$250,000	\$250,000	1	LS	\$150,000	\$150,000	1	LS	\$730,600	\$730,600				
2	Structural Repairs																
2-A	Temporary bracing	1	LS	\$500,000	\$500,000	1	LS	\$50,000	\$50,000	1	LS	\$180,000	\$180,000				
2-B	Demolition	1	LS	\$200,000	\$200,000	1	LS	\$300,000	\$300,000	1	LS	\$361,000	\$361,000				
2-C	Excavation	1	LS	\$198,000	\$198,000	1	LS	\$50,000	\$50,000	1	LS	\$51,300	\$51,300				
2-D	Steel Sheet Pile Wall	1305	LF	\$1,856.94	\$2,423,310	1305	LF	\$2,200	\$2,871,000	1	LS	\$2,457,840	\$2,457,840				
2-E	Rock Anchors, Including Testing	81	EA	\$18,000	\$1,458,000	81	EA	\$15,000	\$1,215,000	81	EA	\$15,700	\$1,271,700				
2-F	Concrete Pilecap/Terrace Beam	1	LS	\$1,485,000	\$1,485,000	1	LS	\$600,000	\$600,000	1	LS	\$670,000	\$670,000				
2-G	Stormwater Pipe Repair	1	LS	\$60,000	\$60,000	1	LS	\$10,000	\$10,000	1	LS	\$97,500	\$97,500				
2-H	Fill Material	825	CY	\$40	\$33,000	825	CY	\$50	\$41,250	615	CY	\$81	\$49,315				
3	Utility Improvements																
3-A	Demolition	1	LS	\$53,500	\$53,500	1	LS	\$10,000	\$10,000	1	LS	\$18,000	\$18,000				
3-B	Electrical	1	LS	\$408,097	\$408,097	1	LS	\$280,000	\$280,000	1	LS	\$266,000	\$266,000				
3-C	Mechanical	1	LS	\$87,380	\$87,380	1	LS	\$20,000	\$20,000	1	LS	\$44,500	\$44,500				
4	Floating Docks																
4-A	Pipe Piles	4	EA	\$9,250	\$37,000	4	EA	\$20,000	\$80,000	4	EA	\$21,750	\$87,000				
4-B	Floors and Connections	1	LS	\$10,400	\$10,400	1	LS	\$25,000	\$25,000	1	LS	\$40,000	\$40,000				
5	Repair Areas on Hard Edge																
5-A	Repair Area	4	EA	\$0	\$0	4	EA	\$0	\$0	15	EA	\$2,200	\$33,000				
TOTAL BASE BID (EXTENDED AMOUNT)					\$ 7,204,000	TOTAL BASE BID (EXTENDED AMOUNT)					\$ 5,202,250	TOTAL BASE BID (EXTENDED AMOUNT)					\$ 6,558,255
(Sum of Items A-1 through A-5)						(Sum of Items A-1 through A-5)						(Sum of Items A-1 through A-5)					