

# **CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMITTEE** **MINUTES**

**November 21, 2019**

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Committee was held on November 21, 2019, at 9:30 a.m. at the Development Resource Center, Conference Room 1A. Vice Chair Melissa Mortimer called the meeting to order and announced that the meeting is being recorded. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Committee. Historic Review Planner Sarah Robbins explained the additional rules of procedures.

**Members Present:** Vice Chair Melissa Mortimer, Lee Helena, Hannah Forman, Matt McDonald, and Skip Pond.

**Members Absent:** Chair Steve Lewin and Rachel Shannon.

**Staff Members Present:** Historic Review Planner Sarah Robbins, Secretary Levi Witt and City Attorney Rob Robinson

**Chairman Havron explained the rules of procedures.**

**Roll Call:** Secretary Levi Witt called the roll.

**Swearing In:** Secretary Levi Witt swore in everyone who wanted to speak to the Commission.

**Applicants Present:** Greg Adams, Nancy Poston, Diana Davies, John Mathna, Hal Baker, John Guthrie, Keith McCallie, Esmi Oehmig, and John Oehmig.

**Approval of Minutes:** Vice Chair Melissa Mortimer made a motion to approve the October 17, 2019 meeting minutes. Lee Helena seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

**Planner Sarah Robbins explained the additional rules of procedure.**

**OLD BUSINESS:**

There was no old business.

**NEW BUSINESS:**

**Case #19-HZ-00147 – 4561 Alabama Avenue – Rear of structure building addition.**

**Project Description:**

The applicant, Keith McCallie, has applied for the following modifications:

1. New construction of a building addition.

Planner Sarah Robbins presented the project.

**Comments from the Applicant:** Applicant Keith McCallie of 1611 Read Avenue explained the project. Ms. McCallie is planning to add an additional bedroom to the house. The house is a two-bedroom, two-bathroom house and Ms. McCallie plans to turn it into a three-bedroom, two-and-a-half-bathroom house. Ms. McCallie brought owners of the property John and Esme Oehmig to the podium to talk more about the proposed project. Mr. Oehmig stated that he and Mrs. Oehmig have owned the property since 2011. He stated to the committee that Mrs. Oehmig was born in St. Elmo and that he and Mrs. Oehmig plan on staying in St. Elmo for the long-term. They love St. Elmo. In order to do that, Mr. Oehmig, said, they would need to add additional space to the house. They are requesting more space to accommodate their family.

**Comments from City Staff or Others:** Committee Vice Chair Melissa Mortimer asked if the home would be losing a window on the rear elevation. Planner Sarah Robbins explained that the house is not a historic structure. The owner clarified that the drawings were not correct, and that the window was being altered.

**Discussion:** A discussion was had between the Committee members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case #19-HZ-00147 – 4561 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, subject to any and all conditions. Lee Helena seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

**Case # 19-HZ-00148: 870 Vine Street - New parking lot, landscaping and fencing.****Project Description:**

The applicant, Greg Adams ( EH Fort Wood LLC ), has applied for the following modifications:

1. New parking lot.
2. New landscaping - shrubs, trees and grass.
3. Remove chain link fence.
4. Add new fence.

Planner Sarah Robbins presented the project.

**Comments from the Applicant:** Greg Adams of 870 Vine Street explained the project. Mr. Adams said that his intent was to change the space for his community. Mr. Adams said that he originally thought that the community needed a parking lot, based on previous conversations he had with various neighbors in the community, but after meeting with his Neighborhood Association, a parking lot might no longer be of interest. Mr. Adams still wanted to come before the committee to see if a parking lot might still be an option.

**Comments from City Staff or others:** Community member and Fort Wood Board representative Diana Davies of 806 Vine Street voiced her opposition to the project. Ms. Davies has lived in the Fort Wood neighborhood for three years and she loves Fort Wood. Ms. Davies is an active member in the community. Ms. Davies explained that the historic guidelines are provided to “protect the character of the district”. Ms. Davies stated that the Neighborhood wishes to preserve as much green space as possible for aesthetic reasons and for environmental impact. Ms. Davies went on to explain some of the negative environmental impacts that come from the construction of parking lots. Neighborhood Association Board member Hal Baker of 921 Vine Street also commented on the project. Mr. Baker asked that the committee be “cautious” when determining how to proceed on the project to protect elm and oak trees that were approved to be removed in preparation of a proposed project that would have allowed new townhouses to be constructed. Mr. Baker stated that the project was not approved, after failing to be in compliance with building code, but the trees were still removed. Mr. Baker said that the Neighborhood Association would be willing to work with Mr. Adams on maintaining the green space. Community member Nancy Poston of 800 Vine Street also commented on the project. Ms. Poston was there to express her own views to the committee and to represent her brother as well. Ms. Poston expressed concern about the addition of a parking lot to the neighborhood. She stated that her car was recently broken into, and she thinks a new parking lot might increase the number of vehicle break-ins. Ms. Poston also said that the Fort Wood apartments already has a sufficient amount of parking. She asked Mr. Adams if he is in need of more parking. Mr. Adams responded and said that he assumed the community wanted more parking. Planner Sarah Robbins added that Mr. Adams had come forth seeking advice on what to do and that he needed ideas. Ms. Robbins explained that the community had parking permits and that when there are parking permits, there is usually a parking shortage and limited parking as well. Ms. Robbins explained that additional parking lots are one of the tools to solve these problems. Mr. Adams explained that he would open the proposed parking lot to the community to park their vehicles. Planner Sarah Robbins said that the lot would not be allowed to be classified as a commercial lot.

**Discussion:** A discussion was had between the Committee members. Skip Pond made a motion to approve Case #19-HZ-00148 – 870 Vine Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, subject to any and all conditions.

**Lee Helena seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.**

**There were conditions noted for the approval: Deny approval of parking lot plan presented on Clark Street.**

**Case # 19-HZ-00149: 808 Vine Street - New roof material ( slate to asphalt ), new handicap ramp, new retaining wall & driveway extended to alley.**

**Project Description:**

The applicant, John Guthrie ( Hope House Campus Ministry ), has applied for the following modifications:

1. New roof material ( slate to asphalt ).
2. New handicap ramp.
3. New retaining wall.
4. Driveway extended to alley.

Planner Sarah Robbins presented the project.

**Comments from the Applicant:** Applicant John Guthrie of 2554 Crestwood Drive explained the project. Mr. Guthrie explained the purpose of the property and what the property is used for. The property houses a youth ministry for students at the University of Tennessee at Chattanooga. Mr. Guthrie described various initiatives the youth ministry partakes in. Mr. Guthrie explained that the various initiatives serve hundreds of UTC students. Mr. Guthrie described construction happening on the property and he stated that the construction has been going on since March. Mr. Guthrie also described the budget for the project.

**Comments from City Staff or others:** Community member Nancy Poston of 800 Vine Street explained her concerns about replacing the slate roof with an asphalt roof. Ms. Poston expressed opposition to the driveway because various portions of brick wall had been destroyed by students who parked there. Ms. Poston said that the driveway was already tight enough as is. Ms. Poston said that “allowing more students” would “hurt the adjoining property”. Community member Diana Davies of 806 Vine Street also spoke. Ms. Davies wished to speak on the proposal of the ramp addition. Ms. Davies joined Ms. Poston in expressing concern about the narrow driveway and concerns about brick columns being destroyed by parking errors. Ms. Davies also believes the ramp will not be aesthetically pleasing. Ms. Davies said that she was not opposed to putting a ramp on a different side; she just isn’t in favor of a ramp addition to the front of the property. Ms. Davies cited some of the Historic guidelines for adding ramps to existing structures. Community member Hal Baker of 921 Vine Street also spoke. Mr. Baker agreed with Ms. Nancy Poston’s position on the slate roof proposal. Mr. Baker also spoke on the handicap ramp proposal. He described his experience constructing housing for individuals with disabilities. It’s because of this experience, he said, that he

supports a lift to the back of the house as opposed to a ramp on the front, citing difficulties in getting ramps installed and accessibility issues. Mr. Baker also expressed concern about a brick wall having to possibly be removed. Community member John Mathna of 806 Vine Street also spoke. Mr. Mathna spoke about the wall on Clark Street. Mr. Mathna said that extending the driveway down to Clark Street will encourage more parking on non-parking surfaces. Mr. Mathna said that the driveway proposal would make the driveway “inaccessible”. Mr. John Guthrie further clarified portions of the proposal concerning the brick wall and the proposed driveway. Mr. Guthrie also clarified his reasoning behind proposing an asphalt replacement to repair the slate roof, citing “economic” reasons. Mr. Guthrie also stated that while he is unsure of adding a ramp to the back of the house, he is open to it.

**Discussion: A discussion was had between the Committee members. Lee Helena made a motion to approve Case #19-HZ-00149 – 808 Vine Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, subject to any and all conditions. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.**

**There were conditions noted for the approval: Approve eave & soffit repair to match existing design and materials, approve roof repair / replacement with slate only; deny design of ADA ramp, deny driveway alley access.**

**NEXT MEETING DATE:** December 19, 2019 (application deadline was November 22, 2019 at 4 p.m.).

**Melissa Mortimer made a motion to adjourn. Skip Pond seconded the motion.**

The meeting was adjourned at 10:58 a.m.

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Steve Lewin, Chair

Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Levi Witt, Secretary

Date